

Special Article - Antibiotic Resistance

Prevalence of Antibiotic Resistance among Bacterial Isolates from Hospital Environments and Effluents

Prasad VG, Baliyan S and Sibi G*
Department of Biotechnology, Indian Academy Degree College, Autonomous, Bangalore, India

*Corresponding author: Sibi G, Head, Department of Biotechnology, Indian Academy Degree College, Autonomous, Bangalore, India

Received: September 19, 2018; Accepted: October 10, 2018; Published: October 17, 2018

Abstract

Intensive use of antibiotics in hospitals provides an environment for antibiotic resistant organisms to flourish, largely unburdened by competition from susceptible organisms. As a result, hospital effluents contribute to the high rate of drug resistant bacteria discharged in the natural environment than domestic wastewater. Understanding the bacterial diversity in hospital wastewater is crucial as hospital acquired infections are an increasing problem. This review presents the microbial population in hospital environments and the identification of antimicrobial resistance strains using non-culture dependent methods reported earlier. In conclusion, the need to assess diversity of microbial population in hospital environment and effluent is required to control the load of antimicrobial drug resistant strains, which would ultimately enter into the environment as biological contaminants.

Keywords: Hospital Waste Water; Antibiotic Resistance; Multidrug Resistant Strains

Introduction

Antibiotic resistance is an increasing health problem as bacterial infections became lasting longer than ever. Due to the high magnitude of impact caused by antibiotic resistance, significant attention from medical community and researchers is happening over the years. Attention to the effects associated with the spread of resistance while treating the disease is necessary to address the prevalence of antibiotic resistance. Hospital wastewater is a hotspot of diversified bacteria and provides an environment for multi drug resistance due to antibiotics, disinfectants, metabolized drugs from patients' fluids [1-3] and contributes to the high rate of drug resistant bacteria discharged in the natural environment than domestic wastewater [4-6]. Hospital effluent contains antibiotic residues that are enough to kill susceptible bacteria and at the same time increases the number of resistant bacteria [7-9]. The intensive use of antibiotics in hospitals provides an environment for antibiotic resistant organisms to flourish, largely unburdened by competition from susceptible organisms. Some studies have shown that certain disinfectants and over exposure of hospital bacteria to disinfectants lead to increased antibiotic resistance [10,11]. Antibiotic resistant organisms are capable of causing life threatening infections that are difficult to control due to the limited treatment options. Characterization of bacteria from hospital environments would provide prevalence of antibiotic resistance among them [12,13] and reduces the further development of resistance to common antibiotics.

The levels of antibiotic resistance in hospital wastewater are higher than in urban wastewater due to antibiotic application patterns in hospitals. Understanding the bacterial diversity in hospital wastewater is crucial as hospital acquired infections are an increasing problem. Surveillance of microbiological analysis of hospital wastewater would control antibiotic resistance and nosocomial infections.

Methodology

A systematic search was carried out in Pub Med, Scopus and Web of Sciences using a combination of Boolean operators. Peer reviewed papers in English on the antibiotic resistance and hospital effluents were retrieved and evaluated based on titles and abstracts. The retrieved papers were managed using Mendeley and the data were consolidated.

Adverse effects of antibiotic resistance

Due to the higher antibiotic consumption in hospitals, the discharge of antimicrobial residues and resistant bacteria in the environment has strong impact on spread of antibiotic resistance. Antibiotic resistance is mediated by diverse resistance genes and it is evident that antibiotic resistance genes can transfer within bacterial communities [14]. These antibiotic resistance genes may either be intrinsic or acquired. Intrinsic resistance is caused in an organism whose innate chromosomal makeup predictable specifies resistance whereas acquired resistance is due to the mutation in its genetic composition. Genes mediating antimicrobial resistance may be found on plasmids, transposons or integrands. The adverse outcomes caused by antibiotic resistant strains mediated infections are higher than the infections caused by susceptible strains [15]. Patients infected with resistant strains require surgical procedures to cure the illness. Extended-spectrum β -lactamase producing strains are associated with higher rates of mortality in patients [16]. High prevalence of antibiotic resistance *Neisseria gonorrhoeae* strain infection leading to treatment failures and subsequent reproductive tract diseases [17]. The antibiotic resistance in community pathogens has led to increased use of other agents in patients admitted with other infection, introducing additional selection pressure for resistance and adding to hospital costs. The other effects include length of stay in hospitals, morbidity and mortality [18].

Table 1: Major bacterial isolates/phyla from hospital environment and effluents.

Bacterial Isolates	References
<i>Aeromonas</i> spp, <i>Kluyvera</i> spp	[41]
Carbapenem-resistant <i>Enterobacteriaceae</i>	[27]
Ciprofloxacin-resistant bacteria	[3]
<i>Citrobacter freundii</i> , <i>Enterobacter cloacae</i> , <i>Klebsiella oxytoca</i>	[56]
Coliforms and faecal Enterococci	[9]
<i>Enterobacter cloacae</i>	[5]
<i>Enterococcus</i> sp	[20]
<i>Escherichia coli</i>	[33,30,23]
<i>Escherichia coli</i> , <i>Acinetobacter</i>	[55]
<i>Escherichia coli</i> , <i>Citrobacter freundii</i>	[25]
Extended spectrum beta lactamase producing bacteria	[53,40]
<i>Faecalibacterium</i> , <i>Aeromonas</i> , <i>Prevotella</i>	[51]
<i>Gamma proteobacteria</i>	[39]
<i>Klebsiella</i> spp, <i>Pseudomonas</i> spp	[38]
Methicillin-resistant <i>S. aureus</i>	[34]
Proteobacteria, Bacteroidetes, Firmicutes and Actinobacteria.	[47]
<i>Pseudomonas aeruginosa</i>	[22,32,37,52]
<i>Pseudomonas aeruginosa</i> , <i>Enterobacter cloacae</i> , <i>Klebsiella pneumoniae</i>	[54]
<i>Pseudomonas</i> spp	[19,46]
<i>Salmonella</i> sp	[48]
<i>Salmonella</i> , <i>Shigella</i> , <i>Staphylococcus aureus</i> , <i>E.coli</i>	[13]
<i>Sphingomonas ursincola</i>	[14]
Vancomycin resistant <i>Enterococci</i>	[6,50]

Culture independent approaches

Had examined the bacterial communities using quantitative PCR and 16srRNA gene based pyrosequencing method [19,20]. qPCR was used to determine the presence of microbial contaminants from untreated hospital wastewaters [21,22]. Metagenomics combined with Search Engine for Antimicrobial Resistance (SEAR) is other technique to determine the full length antibiotic resistance genes from aquatic samples [23,24]. Meta transcriptomics can be used to identify the transcripts of antibiotic resistance genes in various samples [25]. Molecular epidemiological investigations involving Antimicrobial Resistance Determinant Microarray was used to determine the antimicrobial resistance in clinically relevant bacterial pathogens [26].

Antibiotic Resistance Strains in Hospital Environments

A large number of resistant bacteria have been found in the area of hospital wastewater discharge (Table 1) [13,27-55]. Hospital water bacteria seem to play an important role in the dissemination of resistance to antibiotics and the resistance genes are over expressed which is possibly related to the level of antibiotic usage in hospitals [56].

Conclusion

Antibiotic resistant bacteria are more prevalent in hospitals and are released in to the sewage systems and water bodies where

transfer of resistant genes occurs. There is a need to assess diversity of microbial population in hospital environment and wastewater to control the load of antimicrobial drug resistant strains, which would ultimately enter into the environment as biological contaminants.

References

1. Al-Ahmad A, Daschner FD, Kummerer K. Biodegradability of cefotiam, ciprofloxacin, meropenem, penicillin G, and sulfamethoxazole and inhibition of wastewater bacteria. Arch Environ. Contam. Toxicol. 1999; 37: 158-163.
2. Alam M, M Imran. Screening and potential of the incidence of resistance transfer among the multidrug and heavy metal resistant Gram-negative isolates from hospital effluents of northern India. Recent Pat. Antinfect. Drug Discov. 2018.
3. Anssour L, Y Messai, V Estepa, C Torres, R Bakour. Characteristics of ciprofloxacin-resistant *Enterobacteriaceae* isolates recovered from wastewater of an Algerian hospital. J Infect Dev Ctries. 2016; 10: 728-734.
4. Assessment of the antibiotic resistance effects of biocides. Scientific Committee on Emerging and Newly Identified Health Risks (SCENIHR). Directorate General for Health and Consumers. European commission. 2009.
5. Barraud O, M Casellas, C Dagot, MC Ploy. An antibiotic-resistant class 3 integron in an *Enterobacter cloacae* isolate from hospital effluent. Clin Microbiol Infect. 2013; 19: e306-e308.
6. Bonten MJ, Hayden MK, Nathan C, et al. Epidemiology of colonisation of patients and environment with vancomycin-resistant enterococci. Lancet. 1996; 348: 1615-1619.
7. Chagas TP, Seki LM, Cury JC, Oliveira JA, Davila AM, Silva DM. Multi-resistance, beta-lactamase-encoding genes and bacterial diversity in hospital

- wastewater in Rio de Janeiro. *Brazil J Appl. Microbiol.* 2011; 111: 572-581.
8. Chang X, Meyer MT, Liu X, Zhao Q, Chen H, Chen J. Determination of antibiotics in sewage from hospitals, nursery and slaughter house, wastewater treatment plant and source water in Chongqing region of Three Gorge Reservoir in China. *Environ. Pollute.* 2010; 158: 1444-1450.
 9. Chitnis V, S Chitnis, DS Chitnis. Bacterial population changes in hospital effluent treatment plant in central India. *Water Res.* 2004; 38: 441-447.
 10. Devarajan N, Laffite A, Mulaji CK, Otamonga J-P, Mpiana PT, Mubedi JI, et al. Occurrence of antibiotic resistance genes and bacterial markers in a tropical river receiving hospital and urban wastewaters. *PLoS ONE.* 2016; 11: e0149211.
 11. Eliopoulos GM, SE Cosgrove, Y Carmele. The impact of antibacterial resistance on health and economic outcomes. *Clin Infect Dis.* 2003; 36: 1433-1437.
 12. Elmanama AA, AY Elkichaoui, M Mohsi. Contribution of Hospital Wastewater to the Spread of Antibiotic Resistance in Comparison to Non-Health. *J Al-Aqsa Univ.* 2006.
 13. Fekadu S, Y Merid, H Beyene, W Teshome, S Gebre-Selassie. Assessment of antibiotic- and disinfectant-resistant bacteria in hospital wastewater, south Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. *J Infect Dev Ctries.* 2015; 9: 149-156.
 14. Furuhashi K, Y Kato, K Goto, K Saitou, J Sugiyama, et al. Identification of yellow-pigmented bacteria isolated from hospital tap water in Japan and their chlorine resistance. *Biocontrol Science.* 2007; 12: 39-42.
 15. Galvin S, Boyle F, Hickey P, Vellinga A, Morris D, Cormican M. Enumeration and characterization of antimicrobial-resistant *Escherichia coli* bacteria in effluent from municipal, hospital, and secondary treatment facility sources. *Appl Environ Microbiol.* 2010; 76: 4772-4779.
 16. Ghanem B, N Haddadin. Multiple drug resistance and biocide resistance in *Escherichia coli* environmental isolates from hospital and household settings. *Antimicrob Res Infect Control.* 2018; 7: 47.
 17. Grabow W, Prozesky O. Drug resistance of coliform bacteria in hospital and city sewage. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother.* 1973; 3: 175-180.
 18. Gulen TA, Guner R, Celikbilek N, Keske S, Tasyaran M. Clinical importance and cost of bacteremia caused by nosocomial multi drug resistant *acinetobacter baumannii*. *Int J Infect Dis.* 2015; 38: 32-35.
 19. Haller L, H Chen, C Ng, TH Le, TH Ko, et al. Occurrence and characteristics of extended-spectrum β -lactamase- and carbapenemase- producing bacteria from hospital effluents in Singapore. *Sci Total Environ.* 2018; 615: 1119-1125.
 20. Iweriebor BC, S Gagavu, LC Obi, UU Nwodo, AL Okoh. Antibiotic susceptibilities of *Enterococcus* species isolated from hospital and domestic wastewater effluents in Alice, eastern cape province of South Africa. *Int J Environ Res Public Health.* 2015; 12: 4231-4246.
 21. Karatzas K, Webber M, Jorgensen F, Woodward M, Piddock L, Humphrey T. Prolonged treatment of *Salmonella* enteric serovar typhimurium with commercial disinfectants selects for multiple antibiotic resistance, increased efflux and reduced invasiveness. *J Antimicrob Chemother.* 2007; 60: 947-955.
 22. Kerr KG, Snelling AM. *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*: a formidable and ever-present adversary. *J Hosp Infect.* 2009; 73: 338-344.
 23. Ko D, G Offei, FS Codjoe, ES Donkor. Multidrug resistant enteric bacterial pathogens in a psychiatric hospital in Ghana: implications for control of nosocomial infections. *Int J Microbiol.* 2017; 9509087.
 24. Kodzius R, Gojbori T. Single-cell technologies in environmental omics. *Gene.* 2016; 576: 701-707.
 25. Korzeniewska E, M Hanisz. Beta-lactamase producing Enterobacteriaceae in hospital effluents. *J. Environ Manage.* 2013; 123: 1-7.
 26. Laffite A, Kilunga PI, Kayembe JM, Devarajan N, Mulaji CK, Giuliani G, et al. Hospital effluents are one of several sources of metal, antibiotic resistance genes, and bacterial markers disseminated in sub-saharan urban rivers. *Front Microbiol.* 2016; 7: 1128.
 27. Lamba M DWGraham, SZ Ahammad. Hospital wastewater releases of carbapenem-resistance pathogens and genes in urban India. *Environ Science Technology.* 2017; 51: 13906-13912.
 28. Le TH, C Ng, H Chen, XZ Yi, TH Koh, TMS Barkham et al. Occurrences and characterization of antibiotic-resistant bacteria and genetic determinants of hospital wastewater in a tropical country. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* 2016; 60: 7449-7456.
 29. Leski TA, GJ Vora, BR Barrows, G Pimentel, BL House et al. Molecular characterization of multidrug resistant hospital isolates using the antimicrobial resistance determinant microarray. *PLoS One.* 2013; 8: e69507.
 30. Lien LTQ, PT Lan, NTK Chuc, NQ Hoa, PH Nhung, NTM Thoa, et al. Antibiotic resistance and antibiotic resistance genes in *Escherichia coli* isolates from hospital wastewater in Vietnam. *Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health.* 2017; 14: 699.
 31. Linton KB, Richmond MH, Bevan R, Gillespie WA. Antibiotic resistance and R factors in coliform bacilli isolated from hospital and domestic sewage. *J Med Microbiol.* 1974; 7: 91-103.
 32. Magalhaes MJ, G Pontes, PT Serra, A Balieiro, D Castro et al. Multidrug resistant *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* survey in a stream receiving effluents from ineffective wastewater hospital plants. *BMC Microbiol.* 2016; 16: 193.
 33. Maheshwari M, NH Yaser, S Naz, M Fatima, I Ahmad. Emergence of ciprofloxacin-resistant extended-spectrum β -lactamase-producing enteric bacteria in hospital wastewater and clinical sources. *Journal of Global Antimicrobial Resistance.* 2016; 5: 22-25.
 34. Mandal SM, AK Ghosh, R Bikas. Dissemination of antibiotic resistance in methicillin-resistant *Staphylococcus aureus* and vancomycin-resistant *S. aureus* strains isolated from hospital effluents. *Am. J. Infect. Control.* 2015; 43: e87-e88.
 35. Marti E, J Jofre, JL Balcazar. Prevalence of antibiotic resistance genes and bacterial community composition in a river influenced by a wastewater treatment plant. *PLOS One.* 2013; 8: e78906.
 36. Melzer M, I Petersen. Mortality following bacteraemic infection caused by extended spectrum β -lactamase (ESBL) producing. *E.coli* compared to non-ESBL producing *E. coli* *J Infect.* 2007; 55: 254-259.
 37. Miranda CC, I de Filippis, LH Pinto, I Coelho-Souza et al. Genotypic characteristics of multidrug-resistant *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* from hospital wastewater treatment plant in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil. *J Appl Microbiol.* 2015; 118: 1276-1286.
 38. Moges F, M Endris, Y Belyhun, W Worku. Isolation and characterization of multiple drug resistance bacterial pathogens from waste water in hospital and non-hospital environments, Northwest Ethiopia. *BMC Research Notes.* 2014; 7: 215.
 39. Ory J, Bricheux G, Togola A, Bonnet JL, Bernard FD, Forestier C. Ciprofloxacin residue and antibiotic-resistant biofilm bacteria in hospital effluent. *Environmental Pollution.* 2016; 214: 635-645.
 40. Parvez S, AU Khan. Hospital sewage water: A reservoir for variants of New Delhi metallo- β -lactamase (NDM) and extended-spectrum β -lactamase (ESBL)-producing Enterobacteriaceae. *Int J Antimicrob Agents.* 2018; 51: 82-88.
 41. Picao RC, JP Cardoso, EH Campana, AG Nicoletti et al. The route of antimicrobial resistance from the hospital effluent to the environment: focus on the occurrence of KPC-producing *Aeromonas* spp. and Enterobacteriaceae in sewage. *Diagn Microbiol Infect Dis.* 2013; 76: 80-85.
 42. Port JA, Cullen AC, Wallace JC, Smith MN, Faustman EM. Metagenomic frameworks for monitoring antibiotic resistance in aquatic environments. *Environ Health Perspect.* 2014; 122: 222-228.
 43. Poza M, C Gayoso, MJ Gomez, SR Feal, M Tomas, J Aranda, et al. Exploring bacterial diversity in hospital environments by GS-FLX titanium pyrosequencing. *PLoS One.* 2012; 7: e44105.
 44. Rowe W, Baker KS, Verner-Jeffreys D, Baker-Austin C, Ryan JJ, Maskell D, et al. Search Engine for Antimicrobial Resistance: A Cloud Compatible Pipeline and 45. Web Interface for Rapidly Detecting Antimicrobial Resistance Genes

- Directly from Sequence Data. PLoS One. 2015; 10: e0133492.
45. Rowe WPM, CB Austin, DW Verner-Jeffreys, JJ Ryan, C Micallef, DJ Maskell, et al. Overexpression of antibiotic resistance genes in hospital effluents over time. J. Antimicrob. Chemother. 2017; 72: 1617-1623.
 46. Santoro DO, Cardoso AM, Coutinho FH, Pinto LH, Vieira RP, et al. Diversity and antibiotic resistance profiles of Pseudomonads from a hospital wastewater treatment plant. J Appl Microbiol. 2015; 119: 1527-1540.
 47. Szekeres E, Baricz A, Coman C. Abundance of antibiotics, antibiotic resistance genes and bacterial community composition in wastewater effluents from different Romanian hospitals. Environ. Pollut. 2017; 225: 304-315.
 48. Tsai CT, JS Lai, ST Lin ST. Quantification of pathogenic microorganisms in the sludge from treated hospital wastewater. J Appl Microbiol. 1998; 85: 171-176.
 49. Unemo M, WM Shafer. Antimicrobial resistance in *Neisseria gonorrhoeae* in the 21st century: Past, evolution, and future. Clin Microbiol Rev. 2014; 27: 587-613.
 50. Varela AR, G Ferro, J Vredenburg, M Yanik, L Vieira, et al. Vancomycin resistant enterococci: From the hospital effluent to the urban wastewater treatment plant. Science total Environ. 2013; 15: 450-451.
 51. Varela AR, S Andre, OC Nunes, CM Manaia. Insights into the relationship between antimicrobial residues and bacterial populations in a hospital-urban wastewater treatment plant system. Water Research. 2014; 54: 327-336.
 52. Varin A, B Valot, P Cholley, C Morel, M Thouverez, et al. High prevalence and moderate diversity of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* in the U-bends of high-risk units in hospital. Int J Hyg Environ Health. 2017; 220: 880-885.
 53. Walia S, Murleedharn C, Band J, Kanwar M, Kumar A. Quantitation of antibiotic resistance genes pollution in hospital waste water effluent and Urban Clinton River Water, Michigan, USA. Current Medicine Research and Practice. 2016; 6: 149-151.
 54. Wang HP, HJ Jang, J Liu, Q Dong, S Duan, JQ Ge, et al. Antimicrobial resistance of 3 types of gram-negative bacteria isolated from hospital surfaces and the hands of health care workers. American Journal of Infection Control. 2017; 45: e41-e417.
 55. Wang Q, P Wang, Q Yang. Occurrence and diversity of antibiotic resistance in untreated hospital wastewater. Sci Total Environ. 2018; 621: 990-999.
 56. White L, KL Hopkins, D Meunier, CL Perry, R Pike et al. Carbapenemase-producing Enterobacteriaceae in hospital wastewater: A reservoir that may be unrelated to clinical isolates. J Hosp Infect. 2016; 93: 145-151.
 57. Yang CM, Lin MF, Liao PC, Yeh HW, Chang BV, Tang TK. Comparison of antimicrobial resistance patterns between clinical and wastewater strains in a regional hospital in Taiwan. Lett Appl Microbiol. 2009; 48: 560-565.